

## THE EDUCATION TRUST

## Achievement and

 Opportunity in America: Where Are We? What Can We Do?Albuquerque, NM
March, 2014

America: Two Powerful Stories

# 1. Land of Opportunity: 

Work hard, and you can become anything you want to be.

# 2. Generational Advancement: 

Through hard work, each generation of parents can assure a better life - and better education - for their children.

# These stories animated hopes and dreams of people here at home 

## And drew countless immigrants to our shores

# Yes, America was often intolerant... 

## And they knew the "Dream" was a work in progress.

## We were:

- The first to provide universal high school;
- The first to build public universities;
- The first to build community colleges;
- The first to broaden access to college, through GI Bill, Pell Grants, ...

Percent of U.S. adults with a high school diploma

## 1920 1940 1960



## 1980

2000
2012


## Percent of U.S. adults with a B.A. or more

## 2012

## 33\%


© 2014 THE EDUCATION TRUST

# Sometimes, progress was painfully slow--especially for people of color. 

Percent of U.S. adults with a high school diploma, by 2012


Percent of U.S. adults with a B.A. or more, by race 2012


# Then, beginning in the eighties, inequality started growing again. 

## Instead of being the most equal, the U.S. has the third highest income inequality among OECD nations.



## Median Wealth of White Families

## 20 X

that of African Americans

## Q

Not just wages and wealth, but economic mobility as well.

## Now, instead of being the "land of opportunity," the U.S. has one of lowest rates of intergenerational mobility.

Cross-country examples of the link between father and son wages


[^0]
# At macro level, better and more equal education is not the only answer. 

But at the individual level, it really is.

What schools and colleges do, in other words, is hugely important to our economy, our democracy, and our society.

## So, how are we doing?


© 2014 THE EDUCATION TRUST

## First, some good news.

After more than a decade of fairly flat achievement and stagnant or growing gaps in K-12, we appear to be turning the corner with our elementary students.

## Since 1999, large gains for all groups of students, especially students of color

9 Year Olds - NAEP Reading


## Since 1999, performance rising for all groups of students

## 9 Year Olds - NAEP Math



## Looked at differently (and on the "other" NAEP exam)...

## All groups have improved since 1990, some gap narrowing

National Public - Grade 4 NAEP Math


## 1996 NAEP Grade 4 Math



## 2013 NAEP Grade 4 Math



Middle grades are up, too.

## Reading: Modest improvement and some gap closing over the last decade <br> National Public - Grade 8 NAEP Reading



## Math: More improvement and gap narrowing.

## National Public - Grade 8 NAEP Math



## Bottom Line:

## When we really focus on something, we make progress!

Clearly, much more remains to be done in elementary and middle school

## Too many youngsters still enter high school way behind.

## 2013 NAEP Grade 8 Math



## 2013 NAEP Grade 8 Reading



# But at least we have some traction on elementary and middle school problems. 

## The same is NOT true of our high schools.

Achievement is flat in reading for students overall.

17-Year-Olds Overall - NAEP


## Math achievement for students overall is flat over time.

17-Year-Olds Overall - NAEP


And despite earlier improvements, gaps between groups haven't narrowed much since the late 80s and early 90s.

## Reading: Not much gap narrowing since 1988.

17 Year Olds - NAEP Reading


## Math: Not much gap closing since 1990.



Moreover, no matter how you cut the data, our students aren't doing well compared with their peers in other countries.

## Of 34 OECD Countries, U.S.A. Ranks $17^{\text {th }}$ in Reading

 2012 PISA - Reading
$\square$ Higher than U.S. average $\square$ Not measurably different from U.S. average $\square$ Lower than U.S. average

## Of 34 OECD Countries, U.S.A. Ranks $20^{\text {th }}$ in Science <br> 2012 PISA - Science


$\square$ Higher than U.S. average $\square$ Not measurably different from U.S. average $\square$ Lower than U.S. average

## Of 34 OECD Countries, U.S.A. Ranks $27^{\text {th }}$ in

 Math Literacy2012 PISA - Math

$\square$ Higher than U.S. average $\square$ Not measurably different from U.S. average $\square$ Lower than U.S. average

# Only place we rank high? 

## Inequality.

Among OECD Countries, U.S.A. has the $4^{\text {th }}$ Largest
Gap Between High-SES and Low-SES Students



Among OECD Countries, U.S.A. has the $5^{\text {th }}$ Largest
Gap Between High-SES and Low-SES Students



The U.S. Gap Between High-SES and Low-SES Students is Equivalent to Over Two Years of Schooling


Gaps in achievement begin before children arrive at the schoolhouse door.
But, rather than organizing our educational system to ameliorate this problem, we organize it to exacerbate the problem.

## How?

By giving students who arrive with less, less in school, too.

# Some of these "lesses" are a result of choices that policymakers make. 

## Funding Gaps Between States

## Gap

High-Poverty versus
Low-Poverty States
High-Minority versus
Low-Minority States
-\$2,278
per student
-\$2,330
per student

## Funding Gaps Within States: National inequities in state and local revenue per student

## Gap

High-Poverty versus
Low-Poverty Districts
High-Minority versus
Low-Minority Districts
per student
-\$1,122
per student

# In truth, though, some of the most devastating "lesses" are a function of choices that educators make. 

## Choices we make about what to expect of whom.....

## Students in poor schools receive As for work that would earn Cs in affluent schools.



## Choices we make about what to teach whom...

## Even African-American students with high math performance in fifth grade are unlikely to be placed in algebra in eighth grade



## Students of color are less likely to attend high schools that offer Algebra II.



## Students of color are less likely to attend high schools that offer calculus.



## And choices we make about who teaches whom...

## Students at high-minority schools more likely to be taught by novice* teachers.



## Math classes at high-poverty, high-minority secondary schools are more likely to be taught by out-of-field* teachers.



Note: High-poverty school: 55 percent or more of the students are eligible for free/reduced-price lunch. Low-poverty school :15 percent or fewer of the students are eligible for free/reduced-price lunch. High-minority school: 78 percent or more of the students are black, Hispanic, American Indian or Alaskan Native, Asian or Pacific Islander. Low-minority school : 12 percent or fewer of the students are non-white students.
*Teachers with neither certification nor major. Data for secondary-level core academic classes (math, science, social studies, English) across the U.S. Source: Education Trust Analysis of 2007-08 Schools and Staffing Survey data.

## Tennessee: High-poverty/high-minority schools have fewer of the "most effective" teachers and more "least effective" teachers.



Note: High poverty/high minority means at least 75 percent of students qualify for FRPL and at least 75 percent are minority.
Source: Tennessee Department of Education 2007. "Tennessee's Most Effective Teachers: Are they assigned to the schools that need them most?" http://tennessee.gov/education/nclb/doc/TeacherEffectiveness2007_03.pdf.

## Los Angeles: Black, Latino students have fewer highly effective teachers, more weak ones.

Latino and
READING/LANGUAGE ARTS black students are:
effectiveness teachers


# The results are devastating. 

Kids who come in a little behind, leave a lot behind.

# And these are the students who remain in school through $12^{\text {th }}$ grade. 

## Students of color are less likely to graduate from high school on time.

Class of 2009


Add those numbers up and throw in college entry and graduation, and different groups of young Americans obtain degrees and very different rates...

## Whites attain bachelor's degrees at twice the rate of blacks and three times the rate of Hispanics.

Bachelor's Degree Attainment of Young Adults<br>(25-29-year-olds), 2011



## Young people from high-income families earn bachelor's degrees at seven times the rate of those from low-income families.



## These rates threaten the health of our democracy.

But even for those who don't care much about that, the rates are particularly worrisome, given which groups are growing - and which aren't.

## Changing demographics demand greater focus on underrepresented populations.

Population Increase, Ages 0-24, (in thousands)


Percentage Increase, Ages 0-24


Closing racial gaps in degree attainment will create more than half the degrees necessary to raise America to first in the world in degree attainment.

Given these patterns, it is not surprising that our international standing is slipping.

## We're relatively strong in educational attainment.

Percentage Of Residents Aged 25-64 With a Postsecondary Degree


Note: Adults with a postsecondary degree include those who have completed either a tertiary-type B program (programs that last for at least two years, are skill-based, and prepare students for direct entry into the labor market) or a tertiary-type A program (programs that last at least three, but usually four, years, are largely theory-based, and provide qualifications for entry into highly skilled professions or advanced research programs).
Source: Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development, Education at a Glance 2011 (2011)

## Our world standing drops to $15^{\text {th }}$ for younger workers.

Percentage of Residents Aged 25-34 With a Postsecondary Degree


Note: Adults with a postsecondary degree include those who have completed either a tertiary-type B program (programs that last for at least two years, are skill-based, and prepare students for direct entry into the labor market) or a tertiary-type A program (programs that last at least three, but usually four, years, are largely theory-based, and provide qualifications for entry into highly-skilled professions or advanced research programs).
Source: Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development, Education at a Glance 2011 (2011)

## We're near the bottom in intergenerational progress.

Difference in Percentage of Residents Aged 45-54 and Those Aged 25-34 With a Postsecondary Degree



Note: Adults with a postsecondary degree include those who have completed either a tertiary-type B program (programs that last for at least two years, are skill-based, and prepare students for direct entry into the labor market) or a tertiary-type A program (programs that last at least three, but usually four, years, are largely theory-based, and provide qualifications for entry into highly-skilled professions or advanced research programs).
Source: Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development, Education at a Glance 2011 (2011)
© 2013 THE EDUCATION TRUST

# What Can We Do? 

An awful lot of Americans have decided that we can't do much.

What We Hear Many Educators Say:

- They're poor
- Their parents don't care
- They come to schools without breakfast
- Not enough books
- Not enough parents

But if they are right, why are lowincome students and students of color performing so much higher in some schools...

## George Hall Elementary School Mobile, Alabama

- 549 students in grades PK-5 99\% African American
- 99\% Low Income



## Big Improvement at George Hall Elementary



## Exceeding Standards: George Hall students outperform white students in Alabama



## Halle Hewetson Elementary School Las Vegas, NV

- 962 students in grades PK - 5
- 85\% Latino
- 7\% African American
- 100\% Low Income
- 71\% Limited English Proficient



## Big Improvement at Halle Hewetson Elementary

Latino Students - Grade 3 Reading


## High Performance Across Groups at Halle Hewetson Elementary



## Exceeding Standards at Halle Hewetson Elementary



## Calcedeaver Elementary School Mount Vernon, AL

- 262 students in grades K-6
- 81\% American Indian
- 16\% white
- 80\% Low Income



## Outperforming the State at Calcedeaver Elementary




## Elmont Memorial Junior-Senior High Elmont, New York

- 1,895 students in grades 7-12
- 77\% African American
- 13\% Latino
- 25\% Low-Income



## Outperforming the State at Elmont



## Improvement and High Performance at Elmont Memorial Junior-Senior High

African-American Students - Secondary-Level Math


## High Graduation Rates at Elmont Memorial High School



KARIN CHENOWETH CHRISTINA THEOKAS
roakoc RSNaLDR TEROUSSN

## Getting It Done

## LEADING

 ACADEMIC SUCCESSin
UNEXPECTED SCHOOLS

## Available from

## Harvard Education Press and amazon.com



Very big differences at district level, too-even in the performance of the "same" group of students.

## Average Scale Scores, by District Latino Students



## Average Scale Scores, by District African-American Students

Grade 8 - NAEP Math (2011)


In Boston and Houston, Latino students made far faster progress between 2003 and 2011 than in the country as a whole

Latino Students - NAEP TUDA Grade 8 Math


Change in Mean Scale Score, 2003-2011

## African-American students in Atlanta and Boston improved at

 twice the rate of their counterparts nationally

## Bottom Line: <br> At Every Level of Education, What We Do Matters!

## What do the data tell us about New Mexico?

## Scale Scores by State - All Students



## Scale Scores by State - White Students

Grade 4 - NAEP Reading (2013)


## Scale Scores by State - Latino Students



## Scale Scores by State American Indian/Alaska Native Students Grade 4 - NAEP Reading (2013)



## Scale Scores by State - Low-Income Students



## Scale Scores by State - Higher Income Students



## Scale Scores by State - All Students

Grade 8 - NAEP Math (2013)


## Scale Scores by State - White Students



## Scale Scores by State - Latino Students



## Scale Scores by State American Indian/Alaska Native Students Grade 8 - NAEP Math (2013)



## Scale Scores by State - Low-Income Students

Grade 8 - NAEP Math (2013)


## Scale Scores by State - Higher Income Students

Grade 8 - NAEP Math (2013)


## Looking at Performance and Improvement Together

## $4^{\text {th }}$ Grade Reading: NM Rankings on Performance and Improvement

4th Grade Reading: New Mexico's State Rank on the National Assessment of Educational Progress, by Student Group

| Student Group | State Rank Based on Performance <br> in 2011 | State Rank Based on 2003 - 2011 <br> Improvement |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| All Students | 49 out of 50 | 14 out of 50 |
| White | 40 out of 50 | 21 out of 50 |
| African American | 14 out of 45 | 18 out of 41 |
| Latino | 39 out of 47 | 15 out of 40 |
| Low Income | 48 out of 50 | 21 out of 50 |
| Higher Income | 47 out of 50 | 19 out of 50 |

## $8^{\text {th }}$ Grade Math: NM Rankings on Performance and Improvement

8th Grade Math: New Mexico's State Rank on the National Assessment of Educational Progress, by Student Group

| Student Group | State Rank Based on Performance in 2011 | State Rank Based on 2003-2011 Improvement |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| All Students | 44 out of 50 | 6 out of 50 |
| White | 33 out of 50 | 18 out of 50 |
| African American | 15 out of 43 | 14 out of 40 |
| Latino | 25 out of 46 | 9 out of 36 |
| Low Income | 40 out of 50 | 5 out of 50 |
| Higher Income | 43 out of 50 | 5 out of 50 |

# High School Completion and Readiness for College/Career? 

## U.S. Average Graduation Rates and New Mexico's Graduation-Rate State Rank, by Race/Ethnicity

| Group | Estimated <br> U.S. Average <br> Graduation Rate | State Rank |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| All Students | $76 \%$ | 48 out of 50 |
| White | $82 \%$ | 44 out of 48 |
| African American | $64 \%$ | 24 out of 48 |
| Latino | $66 \%$ | 44 out of 48 |
| Asian/Pacific Islander | $92 \%$ | 27 out of 48 |
| American Indian | $65 \%$ | 37 out of 48 |

## ACT Math: Percent of Test-Takers Meeting the College Readiness Benchmark, by Race/Ethnicity

Percent of all graduates tested: 72


Data are for 2011.

## ACT Reading: Percent of Test-Takers Meeting the College Readiness Benchmark, by Race/Ethnicity

Percent of all graduates tested: 72


Data are for 2011.

## New Mexico Army Applicants: Too Many Don’t Pass Entry Test

ASVB Pass Rates: 2005-2009


## What about at the college level?

## New Mexico's high school graduates go on to college at a higher rate than most states



## When high school dropout rate is factored in, the picture is worse

HS Grad Rate x College Continuation Rate, 2008


## And of those who enter, few graduate.

Six-Year Graduation Rates at Four-Year Colleges, by Race/Ethnicity (bachelor's degree completion for first-time, full-time freshmen beginning in fall of 2003)


## Among those who start in four-year colleges, New Mexico has

 one of the lowest Bachelor's degree attainment rates

## Grad rates for Hispanic students are among the lowest in the nation

## Six-Year College Graduation Rate for Hispanic Students (2009)



## Grad Rates for

 American Indian/Alaska Native Students Among Lowest in Nation

## Grad rates for White students are among the lowest in the nation

Six-Year College Graduation Rate for White Students (2009)


## Even among Associate's programs, New Mexico has one of the lowest completion rates

Three-Year College Graduation Rate (2009)


Three-Year Graduation Rates at Two-Year Colleges, by Race/Ethnicity (completion rates include associate's degree and certificate completions for first-time, full-time freshmen beginning in fall of 2006)


# Put this all together, and few young adults in New Mexico have completed a postsecondary degree. 

## New Mexico has one of the lowest rates of young adults with at least an associate's degree

Adults Ages 25-34 with at least an Associate's Degree (2010)


## What Can We Learn From Top Performers and Top Gainers?

# \#1. Good schools, districts don't leave anything about teaching and learning to chance. 

An awful lot of our teachers-even brand new ones-are left to figure out on their own what to teach and what constitutes "good enough" work.

## What does this do?

Leaves teachers entirely on their own to figure out what to teach, what order to teach it in, HOW to teach it...and to what level.

## ' A ' Work in Poor Schools Would Earn 'Cs' in Affluent Schools


$\square$ Low-poverty schools ■ High-poverty schools

# Students can do no better than the assignments they are given... 

## Grade 10 Writing Assignment

A frequent theme in literature is the conflict between the individual and society. From literature you have read, select a character who struggled with society. In a well-developed essay, identify the character and explain why this character's conflict with society is important.

## Grade 10 Writing Assignment

Write a composition of at least 4 paragraphs on Martin Luther King's most important contribution to this society. Illustrate your work with a neat cover page. Neatness counts.

## Grade 7 Writing Assignment

## Essay on Anne Frank

Your essay will consist of an opening paragraph which introduced the title, author and general background of the novel.

Your thesis will state specifically what Anne's overall personality is, and what general psychological and intellectual changes she exhibits over the course of the book

You might organize your essay by grouping psychological and intellectual changes OR you might choose 3 or 4 characteristics (like friendliness, patience, optimism, self doubt) and show how she changes in this area.

## Grade 7 Writing Assignment



# -My Best Friend: 

## -A chore I hate:

## - A car I want:

## -My heartthrob:

## High Performing Schools and Districts

- Have clear and specific goals for what students should learn in every grade, including the order in which they should learn it;
- Provide teachers with common curriculum, assignments;
- Have regular vehicle to assure common marking standards;
- Assess students regularly to measure progress; and,
- Don't leave student supports to chance.


# In other words, they strive for consistency in everything they do. 

## Questions for Common Core Implementation Efforts

1. What do you need to do-what kinds of supports, etc-to avoid teachers having to "make it up for themselves?"
2. What do you need to do differently in schools, classrooms where the aims have been lower?

# \#2. Good schools, districts know how much teachers matter, and they act on that knowledge. 

## Students in Dallas Gain More in Math with Effective Teachers: One Year Growth From $3^{\text {rd }}-4^{\text {th }}$ Grade



## DIFFERENCES IN TEACHER EFFECTIVENESS ACCOUNT FOR LARGE DIFFERENCES IN STUDENT LEARNING



MONTHS OF STUDENT LEARNING

## ACCESS TO MULTIPLE EFFECTIVE TEACHERS CAN DRAMATICALLY AFFECT STUDENT LEARNING

RST TEACHER
SECOND TEACHER
THIRD TEACHER

CST math proficiency trends for second-graders at 'Below Basic' or 'Far Below Basic' in 2007 who subsequently had three consecutive high or low value-added teachers


## So, there are VERY BIG

 differences among our teachers.
## BUT...

## We pretend that there aren't.

## The Widget Effect

"When it comes to measuring instructional performance, current policies and systems overlook significant differences between teachers. There is little or no differentiation of excellent teaching from good, good from fair, or fair from poor. This is the Widget Effect: a tendency to treat all teachers as roughly interchangeable, even when their teaching is quite variable. Consequently, teachers are not developed as professionals with individual strengths and capabilities, and poor performance is rarely identified or addressed."

- The New Teacher Project, 2009

In districts that use a two-rating teacher performance evaluation system-most commonly "satisfactory" or "unsatisfactory"-the "unsatisfactory" rating is rarely used.

| Site | S <br> Number of Satisfactory <br> Evaluation Ratings <br> SY03-04-SY07-08 | Number of Unsatisfactory <br> Evaluation Ratings <br> SY03-04-SY07-08 |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| Denver ${ }^{3}$ | 2,676 | $22(0.8 \%)$ |
| Jonesboro $^{4}$ | 246 | $0(0 \%)$ |
| Pueblo |  |  |
| Toledo $^{6}$ | 1,284 | $2(0.2 \%)$ |

[^1]1 Source: District extant data supplied between April 2008 and March 2009
2 Source: District extant data supplied between April 2008 and March 2009
3 Number evaluation ratings assigned between SY 2003-04 to SY 2007-08
4 Number of evaluation ratings assigned between SY $2003-04$ to SY $2005-06$
5 Number of evaluation ratings assigned between SY $2005-06$ to SY $2007-08$ 6 Number of evaluation ratings assigned between SY 2005-06 to SY $2007-08$

# And, no matter how you measure, some kids aren't getting their fair share. 

## Students at High-Minority Schools More Likely to Be Taught By Novice* Teachers



## Math Classes at High-Poverty and High- Minority Schools More Likely to be Taught by Out of Field* Teachers



## Tennessee: High poverty/high minority schools have fewer of the "most effective" teachers and more "least effective" teachers



## Los Angeles: LOW-INCOME STUDENTS LESS LIKELY TO HAVE HIGH VALUE-ADDED TEACHERS

## ELA

A low-income student is more than twice as likely to have a low value-added teacher for ELA

A student from a relatively more affluent background is $62 \%$ more likely to get a high value-added ELA teacher.


A lowincome student is 66\% more likely to have a low valueadded teacher.

## Low-Achieving Students are More Likely to be Assigned to Ineffective Teachers than Effective Teachers


\#3. Leading schools/districts put all kids—not just some-in a rigorous course sequence that prepares them for postsecondary education.

Single biggest predictor post-high school success is QUALITY AND INTENSITY OF HIGH SCHOOL CURRICULUM

## College prep curriculum has benefits far beyond college.

## Students of all sorts will learn more...

## Low Quartile Students Gain More From College Prep Courses*


*Grade 8-grade 12 test score gains based on 8th grade achievement.
Source: USDOE, NCES, Vocational Education in the United States: Toward the Year 2000, in Issue Brief: Students Who Prepare for College and Vocation

## They will also fail less often...

Challenging Curriculum Results in Lower Failure Rates, Even for Lowest Achievers

Ninth-grade English performance, by high/low level course, and eighth-grade reading achievement quartiles


Source: SREB, "Middle Grades to High School: Mending a Weak Link". Unpublished Draft, 2002.

## And they'll be better prepared for the workplace.

# Speaking of preparation for college and careers... 

In both Common Core and nonCommon Core states, college readiness for all is the new goal.

Do your course requirements for high school graduation line up
with that goal?

## \#4. Leading schools/districts set their goals high.

## Elementary Version...

## M. Hall Stanton Elementary: Percent of $5^{\text {th }}$ Graders ADVANCED



## High School Version...

# Even when they start with high drop out rates, high impact high schools focus on preparing all kids for college and careers 

Education Trust 2005 study, "Gaining Traction, Gaining Ground."

## And the leaders don't think

 about closing the achievement gap only as "bringing the bottom up."
## Percentage Advanced Over Time

White Students (National Public) - Grade 8 NAEP Math


## Percentage Advanced Over Time



## \#5. Principals are hugely important, ever present, but NOT <br> the only leaders in the school

## Elmont Memorial Junior-Senior High School


© 2014 THE EDUCATION TRUST

# \#6. For those of you outside of schools, don't accept the excuses. 

When you see troubling data on your schools, it doesn't help if you just ignore
it. You can help create demand for change by pointing to the successesand by pressing for similar results elsewhere.

## Download this presentation.

## www.edtrust.org

Washington, D.C.
202/293-1217
Royal Oak, MI
734/619-8009


[^0]:    Source: Tom Hertz, "Understanding Mobility in America" (Washington, D.C.: Center for American

[^1]:    All data for tenured/non-probationary teachers.

