Pedal to the metal: How states are (and should be) using federal funds to accelerate learning
Who are we?

Kayla Patrick
Senior P-12 Policy Analyst

Dr. Allison Socol
Assistant Director of P-12 Policy
Welcome & Overview

- What is unfinished learning?
- How do we fix it?
  - Summary of research on targeted intensive tutoring, extended learning, building relationships
- What do we hope states will do?
- Activity
- Opportunities for advocacy
# Accelerate v. Remediate

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Accelerate</th>
<th>Remediate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Connect and blend unfinished learning (unmastered content) to new learning to keep students progressing.</td>
<td>Spend significant time on content already covered (below grade level) without introducing new content.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integrating prior lessons when needed</td>
<td>Re-do content, skills, standards and objectives from prior grades</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Studies found to be effective for students of color</td>
<td>Studies found to only be effective under limited circumstances, and often has many negative effects for students of color and English Learners (drop out, disciplinary issues, long-term economic impacts)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Take a minute to imagine 8 year-old Maya:

• Maya lives with her mom (a nurse), her grandmother, her 12-year-old brother, and 3-year-old sister
• She shared a computer with her brother for the first 4 months of the pandemic
• Her school opted for 3 hours of zoom class a day
  • Her neighborhood has suffered from unstable internet so some days she couldn’t log on for class
• Maya is a natural caregiver; she always wants to help her mom and siblings in any way that she can.
• She is worried about returning to school.
• Maya hasn’t had contact with any school staff outside of her zoom class.
Maya, like many other students, is experiencing unfinished learning. Let's talk about what schools can do to support students like Maya.
Targeted Intensive Tutoring

• Sometimes known as “high-dosage tutoring”
• Same tutor to work over an extended period of time (e.g., all-year, every school day) on academic skills

• KEY EQUITY CONSIDERATIONS:
  • A well-trained, single tutor working with **less than 4 students at a time**
  • A skill-building curriculum closely aligned with the math or reading curriculum used throughout the school
  • Targeted to the student’s academic needs.
How Effective is Intensive Tutoring?

We looked at the research to help leaders navigate complicated decisions. The chart below shows how implementing various features of intensive tutoring impact its effectiveness.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Features</th>
<th>More Effective</th>
<th>Less Effective</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tutors</td>
<td>Certified teachers</td>
<td>Pairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student: Tutor Ratio</td>
<td>1:2:1</td>
<td>3:4:1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curriculum</td>
<td>Skill building curriculum</td>
<td>Homework help</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training and Supervision</td>
<td>Pre-service &amp; ongoing training &amp; supervision</td>
<td>No training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Location</td>
<td>During the school day complementing the regular class</td>
<td>After school/ Out of school</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How often &amp; How Long</td>
<td>All year, every school day for an hour</td>
<td>Partial year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Target Population</td>
<td>Younger students</td>
<td>Older students</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Leveled Literacy Intervention National Tutoring Scale-up

**Tutors:** Teacher, Teacher Assistant, Paraprofessional, Reading Teacher, Literacy Specialist

**Student Teacher Ratio:** 3:1

**Curriculum:** Phonemic awareness, phonics, comprehension, vocabulary, fluency and writing about reading.

**Training & supervision:** School based tutors & Lead Tutors participate in 3 days of initial real-time training provided online by university-based trainers. + Ongoing professional development through bi-monthly live virtual meetings. Tutors receive 75 hours of training in total.

**How often & How long:** 30 minutes daily for approximately 14 - 18 weeks

**Target Population:** K-3

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cost Description</th>
<th>Cost</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tutor (Salary &amp; Benefits)</td>
<td>$35,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lead Tutor (Salary &amp; Benefits)</td>
<td>$75,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tutor Professional Development Online Across the Year</td>
<td>$3500  (per tutor)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(75 Hours)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lead Tutor Professional Development Online Across the Year (100 Hours): Recommended one Lead for up to 20 Tutors</td>
<td>$5500  (per lead tutor)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Materials (print &amp; digital)</td>
<td>Average $2,927</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Cost Per Tutor</strong></td>
<td>$41,427</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Per student (48 per year, per tutor)</strong></td>
<td>$863</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

Detroit Community Schools is expected to receive a total of $808,495,070

The unfinished learning set aside would be **$3,027.73 per student**

Source: [https://proventutoring.org/reading/lindamood/](https://proventutoring.org/reading/lindamood/) & [https://www.michigan.gov/mde/0,4615,7-140-81376_51051-127227--,00.html](https://www.michigan.gov/mde/0,4615,7-140-81376_51051-127227--,00.html)
Expanded Learning Time (ELT)

- Encompasses programs or strategies implemented to increase the amount of instruction and learning students experience.
- Can be after-school, summer, and in-school programs.
- KEY EQUITY CONSIDERATIONS:
  - Aligned to in-school curriculum, targeted to student needs, well-trained educators, small class sizes.

Additional time in school cannot be effective unless traditional school time is also used well including high quality curriculum and instruction.
### How Effective is Expanded Learning Time?

We looked at the research to help leaders navigate these complicated decisions. The chart below shows how implementing different features of expanded learning impacts its effectiveness.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Features</th>
<th>More Effective</th>
<th>Less Effective</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Curriculum</strong></td>
<td>Aligned, individualized, &amp; high-quality curriculum</td>
<td>Clear program goals but not aligned to curriculum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>No clear program goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Training and Coaching</strong></td>
<td>Pre-service &amp; ongoing training, &amp; coaching</td>
<td>Pre-service training only</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>No training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>When and Where</strong></td>
<td>During the regular school year</td>
<td>Mandatory summer programs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>After school or weekends</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Attendance</strong></td>
<td>Mandatory during the school day</td>
<td>Mandatory other times</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Voluntary with incentives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Voluntary with no incentives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Annual Hours</strong></td>
<td>Significant Time (45-100 hours)</td>
<td>Too little Time (less than 44 hours)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Too Much Time (More than 100 hours of reading)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Class Sizes</strong></td>
<td>10-15 students</td>
<td>15-20 students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>20+ students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Teachers</strong></td>
<td>Certified Teachers</td>
<td>Non-Certified Instructors</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Using extended learning time to help recover the estimated seven to eight months of learning that students have lost as a result of the pandemic will cost approximately $9,000 per pupil.

See Education Resource Strategy’s ESSER Strategy Planner & Spending Calculator to compare the sustainability implications of various potential investments of ARP funds.

A Cautionary Tale:

Not all programs during the school day have shown large increases in student outcomes. Implementation decisions matter, and it is imperative that programs center equity and high-quality instruction in those decisions.

In 2012, Florida passes legislation requiring double blocks of reading. A study of the extra hour of reading found relatively small increase in outcomes in some places because many schools were unable to place students with their certified teachers or with small groups.
Strong relationships and connections to schools and the caring educators who teach and work within buildings will be key to the successful implementation of any evidence-based academic intervention to address unfinished learning.
HOW EFFECTIVE IS RELATIONSHIP BUILDING?

We looked at the research to help leaders navigate these complicated decisions. The chart below shows the most effective elements of relationship building strategies in schools.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Elements</th>
<th>More Effective</th>
<th>Less Effective</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Adults</td>
<td>Certified teachers and other staff</td>
<td>Trained volunteers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Other in-school adults</td>
<td>Outside mentors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group size</td>
<td>Individual or small groups</td>
<td>More than 8 students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Activity</td>
<td>Social activity around a student’s goal</td>
<td>Activity not structured around student’s goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Academic activity around a student’s goals</td>
<td>No structured activity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training and</td>
<td>Pre-service &amp; ongoing training, &amp; feedback</td>
<td>Pre-service training only</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supervision</td>
<td></td>
<td>No Training</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Overview of ARP and State Requirements
How did we get here?

**Mar. 2020**
The Coronavirus Aid, Relief, and Economic Security Act (CARES) Act provided $13.2 billion for K-12 education and $3 billion for governors to use on K-12 or higher education.

**Dec. 2020**
The Coronavirus Response and Relief and Supplemental Appropriations and Relief (CRRSA) Act provided $54.3 billion for K-12 education and $4 billion for governors to use on K-12 or higher education.

**Mar. 2021**
The American Rescue Plan Act (ARP) provides $122.8 billion for K-12 education, as well as additional funding for education, nutrition, and childcare.
ARP Elementary and Secondary Schools Emergency Relief (ESSER) Fund

• Funding distributed to states and school districts (i.e., local educational agencies) based on the share of Title I funding they receive under ESSA

• States may keep up to 10% of the money they receive; **90% must go to eligible school districts**

• **What’s New?** Specific set-asides for **evidence-based strategies to address unfinished instruction**, targeted to underserved students:
  • 5% minimum set aside for state educational agencies (SEAs)
  • 20% minimum set aside for school districts

• There are additional set asides for SEAs:
  • 1% set aside for evidence-based, summer programs
  • 1% set aside for comprehensive, after-school programs

• States must meet **maintenance of effort requirements**, and states and districts must meet **maintenance of equity requirements**
How much K-12 Education Relief Funding will each state receive?

Activity:

- **How much is your state receiving?** Once you find out, share it in the chat.

- **Treasure Hunt!:** Can you find your district’s allocations posted on your SEA’s website? If you find it, place the link in the chat!

Map can be found at: https://edtrust.org/strategies-to-solveunfinished-learning/
Key Dates & Timelines

• States have already received 2/3 of their ARP ESSER allocation
• To receive the final 1/3 of their ARP ESSER allocation, states must submit an application to the U.S Department of Education by June 7, 2021
• 40 states have submitted their plans and 17 state plans have been approved
• States must allocate ARP ESSER funds to school districts within 60 days of the state receiving the funds
• There are two relevant district plan requirements:
  1. Within 30 days of receiving funds, districts must release a “return to in-person instruction” plan that includes information about returning to in-person instruction. LEAs are not required to reopen as a condition of receiving funds.
  2. Within 90 days of receiving funds, districts must submit ARP ESSER plans to states detailing how they will use this funding.
• Funds must be used by September 30, 2024
How can funding be used?

- States and school districts are required to engage in meaningful stakeholder engagement, including engagement with students; families; Tribes; civil rights organizations; superintendents and charter school leaders (if applicable); teachers, principals, and school staff; and stakeholders representing underserved student groups.

- Funds can be used flexibly, including to:
  - address the impact of significant interrupted instruction, including addressing students’ academic, social and emotional needs;
  - prepare schools for physical reopening (e.g., sanitation, COVID testing);
  - facility repairs and improvements, including projects to improve air quality in school buildings;
  - purchase education technology;
  - provide mental health services and supports, including through the implementation of evidence-based full-service community schools and the hiring of counselors; and
  - other activities authorized by existing law.
ARP: Additional Targeted Investments

- **Students Experiencing Homelessness**: Invests $800 million for wraparound services for homeless children and youth
- **Students with Disabilities**: Invests approximately $3B nationally into programs funded through the Individuals with Disabilities Education Act
- **Broadband Access**: Provides $7.1B for home broadband connectivity and devices for K-12 students through the E-Rate program - The Emergency Broadband Benefit Program is live now.
- **Emergency Funding Assistance to Non-Public Schools**: Provides $2.75B for non-public schools
- **AmeriCorps Tutors**: Provides $1B for the Corporation for National Community Service and the National Service Trust to support, in part, an increase in tutors trained through AmeriCorps
- **Head Start**: Provides $1B to states to fund Head Start programs
- **Child Care**: Provides $14.9B for the Child Care and Development Block Grant (CCDBG) and another $23.9B for childcare stabilization funding
- **Child Tax Credit**: Expands eligibility to 27 million children (including roughly half of all Black and Latino children); raises the maximum credit from $2000 to $3000 for children between the ages of 6 and 17 and up to $3600 for children under 6; makes the credit fully-refundable
- **Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Benefits (SNAP)**: Extends the 15% increase in benefits through September 2021
- **Pandemic EBT Program**: Authorizes the program, to operate this summer, the duration of the COVID-19 pandemic, and during any school year and subsequent summer in which a public health emergency is declared
What we hope states will do
3 Key Actions for States to Address Unfinished Learning

1) Issue actionable and evidence-based **guidance and support** to districts

2) Require districts to develop **plans** (as required in ARP) that are informed by **meaningful stakeholder engagement**, **rooted in high-quality evidence**, and **targeted to the most underserved students**

3) Collect and publicly **report disaggregated data** to ensure that these funds are being used effectively and efficiently to accelerate learning, especially for the state’s most underserved students
For additional recommendations about how states can advance equity using ARP funds:
Spend For Long-term Sustainability

Determine state and local needs, in consultation with stakeholders, and potential evidence-based approaches to meeting them (e.g. short-term is building up technology infrastructure, long-term may be teacher stipends for tutoring)

Plan for FULL costs (e.g. not just buying ELT curriculum, but include PD/coaching over time)

Invest equitably: as district leaders cost out different strategies, taking into consideration not only everything the strategy involves but how it will target students and schools based on their varying needs

Use existing funding to stretch the window of opportunity (e.g. build out existing PD programs)

Consider time, people, and money! (e.g. embed small group instruction by adjusting schedules and instructional roles, and/or extend learning time by double blocking or using intersession/summer sessions).

Plan for the future and consider how investments will shift over time

Activity
Example: Reviewing Kentucky’s Plan

• What is Kentucky doing well?
  • KDE is using its state allotment for unfinished learning to provide Building Opportunities in Out-of-School Time (BOOST) Summer Learning Grants to districts that operate comprehensive out-of-school-time programming over the summer months and the grants will emphasize children and communities most impacted by the pandemic. KDE will also work with others to fund additional summer enrichment program staffed by AmeriCorps.
  • KDE has provided guidance on evidence-based strategies for addressing unfinished learning, including targeted intensive tutoring and robust summer programs.

• What is missing from Kentucky’s plan?
  • Kentucky states that they have a “limited role in determining how local funds are used” and has not provided a template for districts to use when applying for ARP funds. This is a missed opportunity for the state to ensure that districts use their 20% set aside on evidence-based strategies targeted to the students most in need.
Activity

• Review Section D ("Maximizing State-Level Funds to Support Students") in your state’s plan
  • If your state has not submitted their plan, please select another state to review

• Based on the research, answer these questions:
  1. Does the state's approach to addressing unfinished learning seem sufficient, given the amount of money the state is receiving?
  2. Has the state obligated specific dollar amount for one of the evidence-based strategies we highlighted (tutoring, ELT, SEAD/Reengagement/Relationship building)?
  3. What is missing from your state’s plan?
  4. What, if anything, is the state doing anything to ensure equity?
Window of Opportunity for Advocacy

While many state plans are being approved, there is still more we can do to ensure states are using funds equitably:

• Ask states to issue detailed guidance
• Most applications and plans are high-level, request more detailed plans
• Urge the state to collect and report info about how the money is being spent
Additional Resources
Additional Resources

- Targeted Intensive Tutoring (Ed Trust)
- Expanded Learning Time (Ed Trust)
- The Importance of Strong Relationships (Ed Trust)
- Social, Emotional, and Academic Development Through an Equity Lens (Ed Trust)
- Action Guide: Targeting Resources from the American Rescue Plan to Address the Needs of English Learners (Ed Trust, UnidosUS, The Next100)
- 5 Questions to Ask Districts About How They Will Use New Federal Funding to Support Students (Ed Trust)
- Recommendations for State Leaders to Advance Equity Using Funds from the American Rescue Plan (Ed Trust, UnidosUS, National Urban League, Teach Plus, SchoolHouse Connection, Education Reform Now, National Center for Learning Disabilities, Alliance for Excellent Education, Education Counsel)
- Resource Equity District Diagnostic (Alliance for Resource Equity)
- U.S. Department of Education Resources on the ARP
- “And they cared”: How to Create Better, Safer Learning Environments for Girls of Color (Ed Trust; National Women’s Law Center); includes district checklist
- How to Use American Rescue Plan Act K-12 Education Funds to Identify and Support Children and Youth Experiencing Homelessness (SchoolHouse Connection)
- Sustainability Brief (ERS)
- ESSER School District Strategy and Funding Calculator