Series Workshop #1:
Setting the Stage

October 28th, 2021
Who is the Education Trust?

• The Education Trust is a national nonprofit that works to close opportunity gaps that disproportionately affect students of color and students from low-income families.

• Through our research and advocacy, Ed Trust supports efforts that expand excellence and equity in education from preschool through college, increase college access and completion particularly for historically underserved students, engage diverse communities dedicated to education equity, and increase political and public will to act on equity issues.
Introductions

Kayla Patrick
Senior Analyst P-12 Policy

Allison Rose Socol
Acting Director P-12 Policy

Marissa Alberty
Senior Associate
National & State Partnerships
"There is no power for change greater than a community discovering what it cares about."

Margaret J. Wheatley
Goals

Workshop Series

• **Increase your understanding** of strategies to address unfinished learning and meet students’ social and emotional needs in their districts and communities

• **Build your knowledge** of the federal funding available to support these strategies and the opportunities to influence how those dollars are spent

• **Build your skill and capacity** to leverage your power to fully partner together to support the social, emotional and academic well-being of all students

• **Establish and/or strengthen relationships** with a diverse set of stakeholders around the country.

Session #1: Setting the Stage

• **Understand the current reality** of student learning

• **Take a deep dive into ARP funding**; specifically, around how funding can be used to solve unfinished learning and support social emotional learning

• **Review the research** on unfinished learning

• **Share examples of district strategies and highlight promising practices**

• **Engage in conversation** on building out next steps to tackle the most urgent challenges in your community
Agenda

Welcome - 10 min

Topic Deep Dive - 20 min

Highlight Promising Practices - 15 min

Breakout Discussion - 30 min

Survey & Close Out - 10 min
March 2020: The Coronavirus Aid, Relief, and Economic Security Act (CARES) Act provided $30.75 billion for education, including $13.2 billion for K-12 education and $3 billion for governors to use on education.

December 2020: The Coronavirus Response and Relief and Supplemental Appropriations and Relief (CRRSA) Act provided $82 billion for education, including $54.3 billion for K-12 education and $4 billion for governors to use on education.

March 2021: The American Rescue Plan Act (ARP) provides $122.8 billion for K-12 education, as well as additional funding for education, nutrition, and childcare.
The American Rescue Plan

Funding distributed to state and school districts based on share of Title I money they receive under ESSA.

States must meet maintenance of effort requirements, and states and districts must meet maintenance of equity requirements.

State may keep up to 10% of the money they receive; 90% must go to eligible school districts.

Set-asides for evidence-based strategies to address unfinished learning:
- 5% minimum set-aside for state
- 20% minimum set-aside for districts

There are also 1% state set-asides for evidence-based summer programs and comprehensive, afterschool programs.
How Much K-12 Education Relief Funding Will Your State Receive?

✓ Find the map at
  http://edtrust.org/strategies-to-solve-unfinished-learning

✓ How much is your state receiving? Once you find out, share it in the chat.

https://edtrust.org/strategies-to-solve-unfinished-learning/
How do I find out how much my district will receive?

Dallas ISD: $542,896,598 in ARP funds

At least 20% must be spent on evidence-based strategies to address unfinished learning and to address students’ social, emotional, and academic needs.

Dallas ISD: At least $108,579,320 for addressing unfinished learning
Spend For Long-term Sustainability

Determine local needs, in consultation with stakeholders, and potential evidence-based approaches to meeting them (e.g. short-term is building up technology infrastructure, long-term may be teacher stipends for tutoring)

Invest equitably: as district leaders cost out different strategies, taking into consideration not only everything the strategy involves but how it will target students and schools based on their varying needs

Plan for FULL costs (e.g. not just buying ELT curriculum, but include PD/coaching over time)

Use existing funding to stretch the window of opportunity (e.g. build out existing PD programs)

Consider time, people, and money! (e.g. embed small group instruction by adjusting schedules and instructional roles, and/or extend learning time by double blocking or using intersession/summer sessions).

Plan for the future and consider how investments will shift over time

Key Dates and Timelines

- States have already received at least 2/3 of their ARP ESSER allocation.
- To receive the final 1/3 of their ARP funds, states must submit an application to the U.S. Department of Education.
- All states have submitted their plans and 44 state plans have been approved.
- States must allocate ARP ESSER funds to school districts within 60 days of the state receiving the funds.
- There are two district plan requirements:
  1. Within 30 days of receiving funds, districts must release a “return to in-person instruction” plan that includes information about returning to in-person instruction. LEAs are not required to reopen as a condition of receiving funds.
  2. Within 90 days of receiving funds, districts must submit ARP ESSER plans to states detailing how they will use this funding.
- Funds must be used by September 30, 2024.
Many students have significant unfinished learning.

This has disproportionately affected Black, Latino, and Native students.
We see these same patterns in states and districts across the country.

Figure 8. Differences in proficiency rates on Ohio’s 2020-2021 English language arts tests compared to pre-pandemic years were greater for economically disadvantaged students compared to non-economically disadvantaged students.
We see these same patterns in states and districts across the country.
What is “Unfinished Learning?”

The Education Trust uses the term “unfinished learning,” as opposed to “learning loss” or “learning gaps,” to describe material that should have been presented to students, but has not yet been mastered.

The idea that learning is not complete better reflects the reality that all students can learn and “gaps” can be closed with equitable opportunities, materials, assessments, and high-quality instruction.

With this phrasing, our goal is to redirect any focus on “fixing students” toward a focus on systemic changes to meet the needs of students.
## Accelerate v. Remediate

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Accelerate</th>
<th>Remediate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Connect and blend unfinished learning (unmastered content) to new learning to keep students progressing.</td>
<td>Spend significant time on content already covered (below grade level) without introducing new content</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integrating prior lessons when needed</td>
<td>Re-do content, skills, standards and objectives from prior grades</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Studies found to be effective for students of color</td>
<td>Studies found to only be effective under limited circumstances, and often has many negative effects for students of color and English Learners (drop out, disciplinary issues, long-term economic impacts)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Targeted Intensive Tutoring

• Sometimes known as “high-dosage tutoring”
• Same tutor to work over an extended period of time (e.g., all-year, every school day) on academic skills

KEY EQUITY CONSIDERATIONS:
• A well-trained, single tutor working with less than 4 students at a time
• A skill-building curriculum closely aligned with the math or reading core curriculum
• Targeted to the student’s academic needs (personalized).

Source: https://edtrust.org/resource/targeted-intensive-tutoring/
## How Effective is Intensive Tutoring?

We looked at the research to help leaders navigate complicated decisions. The chart below shows how implementing various features of intensive tutoring impact its effectiveness.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Features</th>
<th>More Effective</th>
<th>Less Effective</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tutors</td>
<td>Certified teachers</td>
<td>Paraprofessionals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student:Tutor Ratio</td>
<td>1-2:1</td>
<td>3-4:1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curriculum</td>
<td>Skill building curriculum</td>
<td>Pre-service training only</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training and Supervision</td>
<td>Pre-service &amp; ongoing training &amp; supervision</td>
<td>Pre-service training &amp; a single additional supplemental training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Location</td>
<td>During the school day complementing the regular class</td>
<td>During the school day substituting for the regular class</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How often &amp; How Long</td>
<td>All year, every school day for an hour</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Target Population</td>
<td>Younger students</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: https://edtrust.org/resource/targeted-intensive-tutoring/
Leveled Literacy Intervention National Tutoring Scale-up

**Tutors:** Teacher, Teacher Assistant, Paraprofessional, Reading Teacher, Literacy Specialist

**Student Teacher Ratio:** 3:1

**Curriculum:** Phonemic awareness, phonics, comprehension, vocabulary, fluency and writing about reading.

**Training & supervision:** School based tutors & Lead Tutors participate in 3 days of initial real-time training provided online by university-based trainers. + Ongoing professional development through bi-monthly live virtual meetings. Tutors receive 75 hours of training in total.

**How often & How long:** 30 minutes daily for approximately 14 - 18 weeks

**Target Population:** K-3

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tutor (Salary &amp; Benefits)</th>
<th>$35,000</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lead Tutor (Salary &amp; Benefits)</td>
<td>$75,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tutor Professional Development Online Across the Year (75 Hours)</td>
<td>$3500 (per tutor)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lead Tutor Professional Development Online Across the Year (100 Hours): Recommended one Lead for up to 20 Tutors</td>
<td>$5500 (per lead tutor)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Materials (print &amp; digital)</td>
<td>Average $2,927</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Cost Per Tutor</strong></td>
<td>$41,427</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Per student (48 per year, per tutor)</strong></td>
<td>$863</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

Detroit Community Schools is expected to receive a total of $808,495,070.

The unfinished learning set aside would be **$3,027.73 per student**.

Source: [https://proventutoring.org/reading/lindamood/](https://proventutoring.org/reading/lindamood/) & [https://www.michigan.gov/mde/0,4615,7-140-81376_51051-127227--,00.html](https://www.michigan.gov/mde/0,4615,7-140-81376_51051-127227--,00.html)
Expanded Learning Time (ELT)

• Encompasses programs or strategies implemented to increase the amount of instruction and learning students experience.

• Can be after-school, summer, and in-school programs.

• KEY EQUITY CONSIDERATIONS:
  • Aligned to in-school curriculum, targeted to student needs, well-trained educators, small class sizes.

Additional time in school cannot be effective unless traditional school time is also used well including high quality curriculum and instruction.

Source: https://edtrust.org/resource/expanded-learning-time/
HOW EFFECTIVE IS EXPANDED LEARNING TIME?

We looked at the research to help leaders navigate these complicated decisions. The chart below shows how implementing different features of expanded learning impacts its effectiveness.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Features</th>
<th>More Effective</th>
<th>Less Effective</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Curriculum</td>
<td>Aligned, individualized, &amp; high-quality curriculum</td>
<td>Clear program goals but not aligned to curriculum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training and Coaching</td>
<td>Pre-service &amp; ongoing training, &amp; coaching</td>
<td>Pre-service training only</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>When and Where</td>
<td>During the regular school year</td>
<td>Mandatory summer programs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attendance</td>
<td>Mandatory during the school day</td>
<td>Mandatory other times</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Annual Hours</td>
<td>Significant Time (45-100 hours)</td>
<td>Too little Time (less than 44 hours)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Class Sizes</td>
<td>10-15 students</td>
<td>15-20 students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teachers</td>
<td>Certified Teachers</td>
<td>Non-Certified Instructors</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: https://edtrust.org/resource/expanded-learning-time/
Using extended learning time to help recover the estimated seven to eight months of learning that students have lost as a result of the pandemic will cost approximately $9,000 per-pupil.

See Education Resource Strategy’s ESSER Strategy Planner & Spending Calculator to compare the sustainability implications of various potential investments of ARP funds.

A Cautionary Tale:

Not all programs during the school day have shown large increases in student outcomes. Implementation decisions matter, and it is imperative that programs center equity and high-quality instruction in those decisions.

In 2012, Florida passes legislation requiring double blocks of reading. A study of the extra hour of reading found relatively small increase in outcomes in some places because many schools were unable to place students with their certified teachers or with small groups.

Strong relationships and connections to schools and the caring educators who teach and work within buildings will be key to the successful implementation of any evidence-based academic intervention to address unfinished learning.

Source: https://edtrust.org/resource/the-importance-of-strong-relationships/
HOW EFFECTIVE IS RELATIONSHIP BUILDING?

We looked at the research to help leaders navigate these complicated decisions. The chart below shows the most effective elements of relationship building strategies in schools.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Elements</th>
<th>More Effective</th>
<th>Less Effective</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Adults</td>
<td>Certified teachers and other staff</td>
<td>Other in-school adults</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Trained volunteers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Outside mentors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group size</td>
<td>Individual or small groups</td>
<td>More than 8 students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Activity</td>
<td>Social activity around a student’s goal</td>
<td>Academic activity around a student’s goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Activity not structured around student’s goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training and Supervision</td>
<td>Pre-service &amp; ongoing training, &amp; feedback</td>
<td>Pre-service training only</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: https://edtrust.org/resource/the-importance-of-strong-relationships/
Addressing The Inevitable Challenges

- Partner with community organizations
- Partner with experts to train inhouse
- Provide technical assistance for school leaders to create effective schedules
- Create time for teachers to meet with tutors
- Provide transportation for ELT programs and make convenient for students and families

Promising Practices
### STATEWIDE SUPPORT

**NEW MEXICO FELLOWS:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Features</th>
<th>Most Effective</th>
<th>Less Effective</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tutors</td>
<td>Certified teachers</td>
<td>Paraprofessionals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student: Tutor Ratio</td>
<td>1-2:1</td>
<td>3-4:1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curriculum</td>
<td>Skill building curriculum</td>
<td>Homework help</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training and Supervision</td>
<td>Pre-service &amp; ongoing training &amp; supervision</td>
<td>Pre-service training only</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Location</td>
<td>During the school day co-teaching the regular class</td>
<td>During the school day substituting for the regular class</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How often &amp; How Long</td>
<td>All year, every school day or for an hour</td>
<td>Partial year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Target Population</td>
<td>Younger students</td>
<td>Older students</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

COLORADO LEGISLATION:

Requires tutoring in groups of four or fewer students;
Students placed with the same tutor throughout the school year;
Happens during the school day
Use high-quality, trained tutors such as teachers, paraprofessionals, community providers, or other individuals who have received specialized training;
Use high-quality curriculum aligned with state standards; and Are data-driven, using interim assessments to monitor student progress.

Source: https://leg.colorado.gov/bills/hb21-1234
“Addressing unfinished learning through acceleration stems from the Department’s firm belief that mitigating barriers to learning serves students and their diverse needs best when driven by an asset-based mindset, which celebrates the value of all learners. This requires viewing student supports as opportunities to build upon and leverage the unique strengths, or assets, that learners bring to the classroom. In contrast, a deficit-based mindset sees student supports as challenges or problems, which can perpetuate existing inequities and lead to lower expectations and learning outcomes for students.”

Source: https://louisianabelieves.com/docs/default-source/accelerate/accelerate---louisiana-s-pre-k-12-tutoring-strategy.pdf?sfvrsn=d7366618_18
Promising Practice: Saga Tutoring

- **Trained tutors** who receive coaching and PD from a coordinator

- **One tutor: two students**

- **One-hour daily** tutoring session as part of their regular class schedule (either during second period of math or replacing an elective course)

- Tutoring sessions = reviewing targeted foundational skills + working on grade-level content in students’ current math classes.

- Impact: Doubled, or even tripled, how much math students learned in a year and the benefits for students persist at least one or two years after tutoring.

- Adopted by districts and states (e.g., Chicago, IL; Guilford County; NC)

- Many districts using their FREE online training

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Features</th>
<th>Most Effective</th>
<th>Less Effective</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tutors</td>
<td>Certified teachers</td>
<td>Peers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student: Tutor Ratio</td>
<td>1:1</td>
<td>3:4:1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curriculum</td>
<td>Skill-building curriculum</td>
<td>Homework help</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training and Supervision</td>
<td>Pre-service &amp; ongoing training &amp; supervision</td>
<td>No Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Location</td>
<td>During the school day complementing the regular class</td>
<td>After school/ Out of school</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How often &amp; How Long</td>
<td>All year, every school day for an hour</td>
<td>Partial year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Target Population</td>
<td>Younger students</td>
<td>Older students</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

The Education Trust
Let’s Look at TutorMe

- TutorMe recruits and selects tutors from universities.
- Students request help on the system and get matched with a tutor.
- One tutor: one student.
- Tutors help with either a specific problem or do an entire lesson on a chosen subject (ex. Algebra).
- 24/7 on demand in 300+ subjects.
- School administrators can use dashboards to track all their students' progress and gather data.

Features:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Features</th>
<th>Most Effective</th>
<th>Less Effective</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tutors</td>
<td>Certified teachers</td>
<td>Paraprofessionals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student: Tutor Ratio</td>
<td>1:1</td>
<td>3:4:1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curriculum</td>
<td>Skill building curriculum</td>
<td>Homework</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training and Supervision</td>
<td>Pre-service &amp; ongoing training &amp; supervision</td>
<td>Pre-service training only</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Location</td>
<td>During the school day complementing the regular class</td>
<td>During the school day substituting for the regular class</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How often &amp; How Long</td>
<td>All year, every school day for an hour</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Target Population</td>
<td>Younger students</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Advocacy Tools

Keeping Equity at the Forefront of Pandemic Recovery

https://masseduequity.org/starting-right-data-stakeholder-engagement/
Dear District Leader

Families, students, and community members have a critical opportunity to advocate for evidence-based and effective policies and practices to use new federal dollars to support the social emotional and academic well-being of systemically underserved students. To support these efforts, Ed Trust created a “Dear District Leader” Letter. This letter can be downloaded, customized, and sent to district leaders.

Send the letter to your district leaders and help ensure the district implements a strong and sustainable plan that includes evidence-based, equity-focused strategies for accelerating learning.

CONTACT YOUR DISTRICT LEADER

https://edtrust.org/resource/5-questions-to-ask-districts-about-how-they-will-use-new-federal-funding-to-support-students/


https://edtrust.org/strategies-to-solveunfinished-learning/
Breakout Groups Discussion

1. Introduce yourselves (Name, district/community)

2. What's resonating from the information you heard today? Any questions?

3. From your position, what is happening on the ground in your local schools/communities? *(What are your local schools/leaders focused on? How do you know? What questions do you still have about your local district’s plan?)*

4. What are the biggest barriers for change in your district (board, leadership, unions, etc.)?

5. What’s working – in your district or in your advocacy – that you’d like to share with others? What support or information do you need most – from Ed Trust or other advocates?

6. What are you taking away from this discussion? Any next steps?
Breakout Groups

**Group 1:** Texas

**Group 2:** Louisiana, North Carolina, Washington & Kentucky

**Group 3:** California & New York

**Group 4:** Tennessee & Georgia

**Group 5:** Maryland, Delaware, Pennsylvania & Massachusetts

**Group 6:** Ohio & Michigan

**Group 7:** All other states
Whole Group Share Out
We love your feedback!

https://tinyurl.com/ULworkshop1
Workshop Series

Session 1 • Setting the Stage

Session 2 • School, Family & Community Partnerships

Session 3 • Holding Districts Accountable for Effective Use of Funding

Session 4 • Supporting Social Emotional AND Academic Development

Session 5 • Continuing to Support Student Learning Through the Pandemic & Beyond

Session 6 • Synthesizing our Learning
Keep in touch

Kayla Patrick
Kpatrick@edtrust.org

Allison Rose Socol
Asocol@edtrust.org

Marissa Albery
Malberty@edtrust.org